



Ethnic Studies Lesson 4Rb: African Americans and Policing Debate, Part 2

TOPIC:

AFRICAN AMERICAN HISTORY

GRADE LEVELS:

11-12

TIME:

1½ HOURS

California Ethnic Studies Model Curriculum Themes, Values, and Principles Alignment

Themes:

2. History and Movement
3. Systems of Power
4. Social Movements and Equity

Values and Principles:

5. Challenge racist, bigoted, discriminatory, and imperialist/colonial beliefs and practices on multiple levels.
6. Connect ourselves to past and contemporary social movements that struggle for social justice and an equitable and democratic society, and conceptualize, imagine, and build new possibilities for a post-racist, post-systemic-racism society that promotes collective narratives of transformative resistance, critical hope, and radical healing.

California English and Social Science Standards Alignment

English Language Arts Standards (11th and 12th Grade):
Reading—Informational Text (RI.11-12)

Determine the central ideas or information of a primary or secondary source; provide an accurate summary that makes clear the relationships among the key details and ideas. (RI.11-12.2)

Evaluate multiple sources of information presented in different media or formats (e.g., visually, quantitatively) as well as in words in order to address a question or solve a problem. (RI.11-12.7)

Speaking and Listening—(SL.11-12)

Initiate and participate effectively in a range of collaborative discussions (SL.11-12.1)

Social Sciences Standards (11th and 12th Grade):
History-Social Science Content Standards—(Grades 9-12)

Analyze the origins, goals, leadership, and tactics of various civil rights movements, including those of Native Americans, Asian Americans, and Latinos. (11.10)

Evaluate the impact of social movements and reforms on changing societal norms and policies.
(11.11)

Analyze the impact of landmark Supreme Court cases and legislation, such as *Brown v. Board of Education* and the Civil Rights Act of 1964, on the advancement of civil rights and liberties.
(12.5)

Lesson Purpose

Students will study policing practices such as traffic stops, pat downs, and the killing of unarmed civilians brought up by the Black Lives Matter movement in order to determine the pros and cons of removing qualified immunity from law enforcement agents.

Essential Questions

After researching the Black Lives Matter movement and policing practices, what are the pros and cons of removing qualified immunity from law enforcement agents?

How has life changed for African Americans over the last 250 years?

Materials

[DEBATE RUBRIC](#)

[ChatGPT](#)

[Unit 4 KWL Chart](#)

Vocabulary

policing

police defunding

qualified immunity

Black Lives Matter

Lesson Steps

Step 1:

- As a class, remind students about the [DEBATE RUBRIC](#). Take time to review each norm and let students know they will be evaluating themselves and the other team when the debate is concluded.

Step 2:

- As a class, have the two student groups continue their research and organize their cards by topic. Have them continue to pose questions to ChatGPT and continue finding evidence from reputable sources. Encourage students to anticipate the questions from the other group and research those questions in order to find rebuttals. Allow the groups to work for an additional 20 minutes if possible.

Step 3:

- When the research time has elapsed, as a class, introduce the students to a circular debate. Half of the students from each team will sit in chairs that are arranged in a circle. The other half of the students will stand behind the students who are actively participating in the debate. The students who are standing are given sticky notes in order to remind the debate participants about key facts they may have forgotten. Students inside the circle will be holding the note cards the group has made with evidence.
- The students who are seated can start the discussion at any time by saying something like:
 - According to the website..., this point was made.
 - According to this authority..., this point was made.
- Students should listen carefully and wait their turn to speak. Seated students can also support their own team by saying something like:
 - I agree with my friend..., and I would add....
- Or students can disagree with the other team by saying something like:
 - While I see your point, I would disagree. According to this website..., this point was made....
- Students who are standing can pass sticky notes to those who are sitting in order to keep the debate going.

Step 4:

- As a class, once the debate is concluded, or after about 20 minutes, have the students return to their groups and have them make a copy of and fill out the [DEBATE RUBRIC](#) for their group.
- When students have completed the rubric, as a class, review the debate rubrics and have students discuss how their debate went. What can they do next time to improve? Did the debate change their attitudes about qualified immunity for law enforcement officers? In what ways is it difficult to correct race-based discrimination?

Step 5:

- As a class, ask students this lesson's questions, "After researching the Black Lives Matter movement and policing practices, what are the pros and cons of removing qualified immunity from law enforcement agents?" Also, ask students this unit's question, "How have the lives of African Americans changed over the last 250 years?" Make notes of what was learned on this unit's KWL chart. (If time permits, have students watch the [American Bar Association Debate on Qualified Immunity](#) (video 13 minutes, 48 seconds.)

Essential Question Assessment, Application, Action, and Reflection

For homework, have students write a short paragraph of how their beliefs about qualified immunity for law enforcement officers have stayed the same or changed over the course of the debate. Also, they should include in their paragraph their observations on some of the difficulties of trying to improve race-based societal relations.

Additional Readings and Resources

[America Run Riot – Commentary Magazine](#)

[American BAR Association: Qualified immunity: A necessity or a tool that exploits race and class?](#)

Boghossian, Peter, and James Lindsay. *How to Have Impossible Conversations: A Very Practical Guide*. Lifelong

Books, 2019.

Capaldi, Nicholas, and Miles Smit. *The Art of Deception: An Introduction to Critical Thinking*, 2nd ed. Prometheus, 2019.

[Defunding the Police Is Asinine and Counterproductive | Opinion - Newsweek](#)

Evers, Williamson M. “Recommended Readings on Police Reform.” Independent Institute, 2020. <https://www.independent.org/issues/article.asp?id=13207>

[Excessive policing is a serious discussion: Deroy Murdock | Fox Business Video](#)

[Legal Defense Fund: Qualified Immunity FAQ](#)

Reilly, Wilfred, Robert Maranto, and Patrick Wolf. “Did Black Lives Matter Save Black Lives?” *Commentary*, September 2022. <https://www.commentary.org/articles/wilfred-reilly/did-black-lives-matter-save-black-lives>

Reilly, Wilfred. *Hate Crime Hoax*. Regnery, 2019, chap. 2, 19-53.

Reilly, Wilfred. *Taboo: Ten Facts You Can't Talk About*. Regnery, 2020, chap. 1.

Sowell, Thomas. *Ethnic America: A History*. Basic Books, 1981, 183-224.

Sowell, Thomas. “The War on Cops, Parts I & II.” Creators Syndicate, July 12, 2016. <https://www.lanereport.com/65360/2016/07/opinion-thomas-sowell-the-war-on-cops-in-two-part/>

[Washington Post: Qualified Immunity, explained](#)

NOTE TO EDUCATORS REGARDING ADDITIONAL READINGS AND RESOURCES: America is a pluralistic country, ethnically. It is also a pluralistic country politically—left, right, and center. Ethnic studies educators have ready access to resources from the left-of-center in the [2021 California Model Curriculum](#) and in the [Liberated Model Curriculum](#). This Comparative Cultures Ethnic Studies curriculum favors teachers exposing students to views from across the political spectrum. Educators often lack guidance to materials from outside the left-of-center. Therefore, in the sections on Additional Readings and Resources, the Comparative Cultures Ethnic Studies curriculum alerts educators to credible resources that provide an alternative to the other Model Curricula. In doing so, this curriculum encourages educators to acquaint students with evidence-based views from left, right, and center.

Ethnic Studies 1Ia: Debate Rubric

Rate on a scale of 1 to 3, with 1 being did well in adhering to the norm and 3 being did not do well in adhering to norm.

FOR TEAM
(1 to 3) and comments

AGAINST TEAM
(1 to 3) and comments

Adhered to classroom norms of respect and allowing others to speak		
Included evidence with citation or attribution while inside the circle		
Provided supporting evidence with citation or attribution while outside the circle		
Participated in a lively debate even if the topic was not their first choice		
Encouraged different viewpoints, reflected on own biases and assumptions, challenged others to maintain an open mind		
Listened actively while not speaking		
Acknowledged differing points of view and maintained civility		

Ethnic Studies 4A: KWL Chart

KNOW	WONDER	LEARNED
<i>What do we think we already know about this topic?</i>	<i>What do we wonder about this topic? Write your questions below.</i>	<i>After the research is completed, what did we learn? Make sure to cite your source.</i>